SOB-COMMON DAMES

PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY OF

COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA STATE CORPORATION COMMISSION 2024 SEP 16 P 18: 20

APPLICATION OF

VIRGINIA ELECTRIC AND POWER COMPANY

CASE NO. PUR-2024-00123

For an update of the 100 percent renewable energy tariff, designated Rider TRG, pursuant to §§ 56-577 A 5 and 56-234 of the Code of Virginia

HEARING EXAMINER'S PROTECTIVE RULING AND ADDITIONAL PROTECTIVE TREATMENT FOR EXTRAORDINARILY SENSITIVE MARKET INFORMATION

September 16, 2024

On July 1, 2024, Virginia Electric and Power Company ("Dominion" or "Company") filed with the State Corporation Commission ("Commission") an application ("Application") pursuant to §§ 56-577 A 5 and 56-234 of the Code of Virginia for an annual update of the Company's voluntary 100 percent renewable energy tariff, designated Rider TRG, whereby participating customers can voluntarily elect to purchase 100% of their energy and capacity needs sourced from renewable energy resources.

On July 26, 2024, the Commission entered an Order for Notice and Comment in which, among other things, the Commission docketed the case; established a procedural schedule for the Application, including opportunities for any interested person to file comments or request a hearing on the Application; required the Commission's Staff ("Staff") to investigate the Application and file a Staff Report with its findings and recommendations; and appointed a hearing examiner to rule on any discovery matters that arise during the course of this proceeding and any motions *pro hac vice* that are filed in this docket.

On September 12, 2024, Dominion filed a Motion for Entry of a Protective Order and Additional Protective Treatment ("Motion"). Therein, the Company asserted that Staff issued its first set of data requests to Dominion on September 5, 2024, and the Company's responses contain extraordinarily sensitive information related to market information, including renewable energy certificate market information ("Market Information"). The Company further represented that throughout this case confidential and extraordinarily sensitive information may be provided to Staff or parties in response to interrogatories or requests for production of documents or things. Therefore, pursuant to Rule 170 of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure ("Rules"), the Company filed the Motion to request the Commission enter a Protective Order, which also grants the Company's proposed treatment of extraordinarily sensitive Market Information. Dominion attached to the Motion a Proposed Protective Order.

¹ 5 VAC 5-20-10 et seq.

² Motion at 2.

³ Motion at Attachment 1.

Dominion explained why it contends the Market Information warrants extraordinarily sensitive treatment beyond the protections afforded confidential information.⁴ The Company requested the following protections be placed on the Market Information:⁵

- Access to the Market Information shall be given to (i) in-house counsel and/or parties not engaged in the business of, or providing services related to, the development, manufacturing, construction, operation, or installation of energy projects (including but not limited to solar, wind, or energy storage developers), energy project equipment supply, wholesale power market participation, independent power production, project bidding, or electric generating business development; (ii) outside retained counsel; or (iii) individual consultants who have been retained by a party for the purposes of providing consulting services and/or expert testimony in this proceeding;
- Oral testimony concerning the extraordinarily sensitive information will be taken *in camera*;
- If an attorney licensed to practice law in Virginia, admitted pro hac vice in this case, or employed as corporate counsel, returning or destroying documents containing extraordinarily sensitive information except for the attorney's notes and work product, and documents that are part of the record in this proceeding (including, but not limited to, transcripts, testimony, exhibits, pleadings, rulings, and orders); and if not covered by or included in the above categories, returning or destroying all documents containing extraordinarily sensitive information upon conclusion of the proceedings, and any appeal thereof;
- No party or consultant may use the extraordinarily sensitive information to give any party or any competitor of any participant a commercial advantage; provided, however, that nothing in the agreement shall prevent any person signing it from using the extraordinarily sensitive information in this proceeding consistent with the terms of the agreement and the Protective Order.
- Paragraph (13) of the Protective Order shall include the following language:

Notwithstanding the provisions of this Paragraph, the Company may designate certain, limited information as extraordinarily sensitive information without first seeking and obtaining prior Commission approval for such designation.

⁴ Id. at 5-6.

⁵ Id. at 6-7.

Such information shall be within the scope of information designated in the Motion as "extraordinarily sensitive" involving Market Information as defined in the Motion. However, the Commission, any Hearing Examiner assigned to this docket, the Staff, or any party hereto, may challenge the Company's designation of any such information as extraordinarily sensitive. Upon such challenge, the Company shall have the burden to demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Commission or Hearing Examiner, as the case may be, that this Protective Order does not otherwise provide the information claimed to be extraordinarily sensitive, sufficient protection and that the additional, proposed restrictions are necessary.

Subject to the provisions of the Protective Order and Additional Protective Treatment for Extraordinarily Sensitive Information, and execution by appropriate party representatives (other than Staff) of the "Agreement to Adhere to the Order Granting Additional Protective Treatment for Extraordinarily Sensitive Market Information" included as <u>Attachment B</u>, the Company agrees to provide copies of the extraordinarily sensitive information.

Dominion represented the above restrictions should not negatively impact access to extraordinarily sensitive information by Staff or the Office of the Attorney General's Division of Consumer Counsel.⁶

I find that to permit the development of all issues in this proceeding, and to facilitate the filing and exchange of confidential information and extraordinarily sensitive Market Information, a Protective Ruling and Additional Protective Treatment for Extraordinarily Sensitive Market Information should be entered. The terms of this ruling are substantially similar to those in the Proposed Protective Order and the terms adopted in Case No. PUR-2023-00221.⁷ This Ruling may be subject to modification upon motion and good cause shown. Accordingly,

IT IS DIRECTED THAT the following procedures shall be established for the filing, exchange, and handling of confidential information and documents in this case:

[°] Id. at 7

⁷ As compared to the Proposed Protective Order and the protective ruling in Case No. PUR-2023-00221, this ruling provides tighter timeframes for responses and reply to a motion challenging the confidential designation of information pursuant to Ruling Paragraph (7) herein. This modification is made considering the expedited (five-business-day) timeframe for responses to interrogatories and requests for the production of documents set forth in Ordering Paragraph (17) of the Commission's Order for Notice and Comment. Additionally, since the Motion requests extraordinarily sensitive protection only for "Market Information" (as defined in the Motion), and since the Company would have to file another motion to obtain extraordinarily sensitive protection for other types of information, Ruling Paragraph (19) and Attachment B generally refer to "Market Information" instead of "extraordinarily sensitive information."

- (1) Any documents, materials and information to be filed with or delivered to the Commission or produced by any party to Staff or another party, including transcripts, which the producing party designates and clearly marks as confidential or as containing trade secrets, privileged, or confidential commercial or financial information ("Confidential Information"), shall be filed, produced, examined, and used only in accordance with the conditions set forth below. Information that is available to the public anywhere else will not be granted confidential treatment and shall not be designated as "Confidential Information" by any party.
- (2) Parties shall clearly mark and file under seal with, or deliver to, the Commission all information otherwise required to be filed or delivered but considered by the party to be Confidential Information. Items filed or delivered under seal shall be securely sealed in an opaque container that is clearly labeled "UNDER SEAL" and, if filed, shall meet the other requirements for filing contained in the Commission's Rules. An original and fifteen (15) copies of all such information shall be filed with the Clerk of the Commission and one (1) additional copy of all such information shall also be delivered under seal to the Staff counsel assigned to the matter.
- (3) Parties shall also file with, or deliver to, the Commission an original and one (1) copy of an expurgated or redacted version of all such documents containing Confidential Information for use and review by the public. On every document filed or delivered under seal as containing some Confidential Information, the producing party shall mark each individual page of the document that contains such Confidential Information and shall clearly indicate the specific information requested to be treated as confidential by the use of highlighting, underscoring, bracketing or other appropriate marking. All remaining materials on each page of the document shall be treated as non-confidential and be available for public use and review, as well as introduction at any hearing without regard to the remaining procedures established by this Protective Ruling. If an entire document is confidential, or if all information provided in electronic format is confidential, a marking prominently displayed on the first page of such document, or at the beginning of any information provided in electronic format, indicating that the entire document is confidential, shall suffice.
- (4) If information that is requested pursuant to a discovery request in this proceeding is considered by the producing party to be Confidential Information, the producing party shall clearly mark all Confidential Information produced to Staff or other individuals authorized under this Protective Ruling to receive Confidential Information.
- (5) Confidential Information from this proceeding that is retained by an attorney pursuant to Paragraph (17) (a), below, is not precluded from use in a subsequent Commission proceeding (if otherwise relevant and admissible), but shall remain subject to this Protective Ruling and any future order or ruling related thereto. Otherwise, all Confidential Information filed or produced by a party shall be used solely for the purpose of this proceeding (including any appeals).
- (6) Access to Confidential Information shall be provided and specifically limited to Staff and any party, their counsel and expert witnesses, and to support personnel working on this case or a future case, subject to the conditions in Paragraphs (5), (17) (a), and (17) (b), under the

supervision of said counsel or expert witnesses and to whom it is necessary that the Confidential Information be shown for the purpose of this or a future proceeding, provided each such person granted access has previously executed an Agreement to Adhere to Protective Ruling Providing for Confidential Treatment ("Agreement"), which is set forth as <u>Attachment A</u> to this Protective Ruling. Staff and Staff counsel are not required to sign the Agreement but are hereby ordered to preserve the confidentiality of the Confidential Information. All Agreements shall be promptly forwarded to the producing party and Staff counsel and filed with the Clerk of the Commission upon execution.

- (7) Staff or any party to the proceeding may challenge the confidential designation of particular information by filing a motion promptly with the Commission. Any motion filed under this section shall, except for good cause shown, be accompanied by a certification that the movant has in good faith conferred, or attempted to confer, with the party asserting confidential treatment in an effort to resolve the dispute without Commission action. The Commission or Hearing Examiner will conduct an *in camera* review of the challenged documents, materials or information. Upon challenge, the information shall be treated as confidential pursuant to the Rules only where the party requesting confidential treatment can demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Commission or Hearing Examiner that the risk of harm of publicly disclosing the information outweighs the presumption in favor of public disclosure. In no event shall any party disclose the Confidential Information it has received subject to this Protective Ruling absent a finding by the Commission or Hearing Examiner that such information does not require confidential treatment.
- (a) Within three (3) business days of the filing of the motion, the party requesting confidential treatment shall file a response. The response shall respond to each and every document and all information that is subject to the party's motion. The response shall: (1) describe each document and all information, such description to include the character and contents of each document and all information to the extent reasonably possible without disclosing the Confidential Information; (2) explain in detail why the information requires confidential treatment; and (3) describe and explain in detail the anticipated harms that might be suffered as a result of the failure of the document to be treated as confidential.
- (b) Within three (3) business days of the filing of the motion, Staff or any party to the proceeding may file a response.
- (c) Within two (2) business days of the filing of any response, the party objecting to confidential treatment, or Staff if Staff is challenging confidentiality, may file a reply.
- (d) Upon a determination by the Commission or the Hearing Examiner that all or portions of any materials filed under seal are not entitled to confidential treatment, the filing party shall file an original and one (1) copy of the redacted, or unredacted, if applicable, version of the document reflecting the determination.
- (8) The Commission or the Hearing Examiner may challenge, *sua sponte*, the confidential designation of particular information at any time during the proceeding. If prior to the hearing, the Hearing Examiner challenges the confidential designation of particular

information, the Hearing Examiner shall issue a ruling directing the party requesting confidential treatment to demonstrate that the risk of harm of publicly disclosing the information outweighs the presumption in favor of public disclosure. The Hearing Examiner will conduct an *in camera* review of the challenged documents, materials or information. The party requesting confidential treatment shall submit a response as directed by the Hearing Examiner. The response shall respond to each and every document and all information that is subject to the ruling. The response shall: (1) explain in detail why the information requires confidential treatment; and (2) describe and explain in detail the anticipated harms that might be suffered as a result of the failure of the document to be treated as confidential. In no event shall any party disclose the Confidential Information it has received subject to this Protective Ruling absent a finding by the Hearing Examiner or the Commission that such information does not require confidential treatment.

- (9) In the event that Staff or any party seeks permission to grant access to any Confidential Information to any person other than a person authorized to receive such information under Paragraph (6) above, Staff or the party desiring permission shall first obtain the consent of counsel for the producing party. In the event of a negative response, Staff or the party seeking disclosure permission may file a motion with the Commission for such permission and shall bear the burden of proving the necessity for such disclosure.
- (10) The producing party shall be under no obligation to furnish Confidential Information to persons other than those authorized to receive such information under Paragraph (6) above unless specifically ordered otherwise by the Commission or Hearing Examiner. Parties are encouraged to seek consent to disclose information or documents designated as confidential from the producing party to the maximum extent practicable before filing a motion pursuant to Paragraph (9) above.
- (11) The Clerk of the Commission is directed to maintain under seal all documents, materials and information filed with the Commission in this proceeding that the producing party has designated as Confidential Information until further Order of the Commission or Hearing Examiner Ruling.
- (12) A producing party is obligated to separate to the fullest extent practicable non-confidential documents, materials and information from Confidential Information and to provide the non-confidential documents, materials and information without restriction.
- (13) To the extent that a party contends the terms of this Protective Ruling do not provide sufficient protection to prevent harm to the producing party or to others, the party may request additional protection for extraordinarily sensitive information by filing a motion with the Commission, pursuant to 5 VAC 5-20-110 and 5 VAC 5-20-170 of the Commission's Rules. The moving party shall also file such extraordinarily sensitive information with the Clerk of the Commission under seal and deliver a copy of the information to Staff counsel under seal, pursuant to Paragraph (2) above. The producing party has the burden to demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Commission that this Protective Ruling does not provide the extraordinarily sensitive information sufficient protection and that the proposed restrictions are necessary.

- (a) The motion shall: (1) describe each document and all information for which additional protection is sought, such description to include the character and contents of each document and all information to the extent reasonably possible without disclosing the Confidential Information; (2) explain in detail for each document and all information why the confidential treatment afforded under this Protective Ruling is not sufficient to protect the producing party's interests; (3) describe and explain in detail the anticipated harms that might be suffered if the information is not afforded the higher protection; and (4) explain the producing party's proposed additional restrictions and why such restrictions are the minimum necessary to protect that party.
- (b) Within three (3) business days of the filing of the motion, Staff and any party may file a response to the motion.
- (c) Within two (2) business days of the filing of any response, the producing party may file a reply.

Notwithstanding the provisions of this Paragraph, the Company may designate certain, limited information as extraordinarily sensitive information without first seeking and obtaining prior Commission approval for such designation. Such information shall be within the scope of the information designated as "extraordinarily sensitive" in the Motion of Virginia Electric and Power Company for Entry of a Protective Order and Additional Protective Treatment, involving Market Information as defined in that Motion. However, the Commission, any Hearing Examiner assigned to this docket, Staff, or any party hereto, may challenge the Company's designation of any such information as extraordinarily sensitive. Upon such challenge, the Company shall have the burden to demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Commission or Hearing Examiner, as the case may be, that this Protective Ruling does not otherwise provide the information claimed to be extraordinarily sensitive, sufficient protection and that the additional, proposed restrictions are necessary.

- (14) In the event that any party or Staff seeks to use Confidential Information in filed pleadings, testimony, or other documents, Staff or the party seeking such introduction shall:
- (a) file both confidential and non-confidential versions of the pleading, testimony, or other document. Confidential versions of the filed pleadings, testimony, or other documents shall clearly indicate the confidential material, including extraordinarily sensitive information, if any, contained within by highlighting, underscoring, bracketing or other appropriate marking; and
- (b) submit the confidential version to the Clerk of the Commission securely sealed in an opaque container that is clearly labeled "UNDER SEAL." Non-confidential versions of filed pleadings, testimony, or other documents shall redact all references to the Confidential Information. The filed pleadings, testimony, or other documents containing the Confidential Information shall be kept under seal unless and until the Commission rules to the contrary. Each party having signed Attachment A hereof, Staff, and each party to whom the Confidential Information belongs shall receive a copy of those parts of the filed pleadings, testimony, or other documents that contain references to or portions of the designated Confidential Information;

provided, however, that a party shall not be entitled to receive an unredacted copy of filed pleadings, testimony, or other documents that include extraordinarily sensitive information for which additional protective treatment has been provided by Commission Order or Hearing Examiner Ruling, unless such party otherwise has been provided access to such information contained in such filed pleadings, testimony, or other documents by such Order or Ruling. Each party having signed Attachment A hereof and Staff shall be bound by the-Protective Ruling insofar as it restricts the use of and granting of access to the Confidential Information and by any such Order or Ruling providing additional protections for the extraordinarily sensitive information.

- (15) Oral testimony regarding Confidential Information, if ruled admissible by the Commission, will be taken *in camera* and in the presence of only Staff and those other persons who have been granted access to such specific Confidential Information pursuant to this Protective Ruling. That portion of the transcript recording such testimony shall be placed in the record under seal.
- (16) No person authorized under this Protective Ruling to have access to Confidential Information shall disseminate, communicate or reveal any such Confidential Information to any person not specifically authorized under this Protective Ruling to have access to the same.
- (17) (a) Attorneys may retain Confidential Information contained in their notes, other work product, and documents that are part of the record in this proceeding (including, but not limited to, transcripts, testimony, exhibits, pleadings, rulings, and orders), provided that Confidential Information contained therein must continue to be treated as directed by this Protective Ruling.
- (b) If not covered by (a), above, at the conclusion of this proceeding (including any appeals), any originals or reproductions of any Confidential Information produced pursuant to this Protective Ruling shall be returned to the producing party or destroyed. In addition, at such time, any notes, analysis, or other documents prepared containing Confidential Information shall be destroyed. At such time, any originals or reproductions of any Confidential Information, or any notes, analysis, or other documents prepared containing Confidential Information in Staff's possession, will be returned to the producing party, destroyed, or kept with Staffs permanent work papers in a manner that will preserve the confidentiality of the Confidential Information. The producing party shall also retain all Confidential Information for a period of at least five (5) years after the conclusion of this proceeding (including any appeals). Insofar as the provisions of this Protective Ruling restrict the communications and use of the Confidential Information produced hereunder, such restrictions shall continue to be binding after the conclusion of this proceeding (including any appeals) as to the Confidential Information.
- (18) Any party or person who obtains Confidential Information and thereafter fails to reasonably protect or misuses it in any way shall be subject to sanctions as the Commission may deem appropriate, including the penalties provided for in § 12.1-33 of the Code of Virginia. This provision is not intended to limit the producing party's rights to pursue any other legal or equitable remedies that may otherwise exist.

- (19) Attachment B is hereby adopted to address, upon the following terms and conditions, the handling of extraordinarily sensitive "Market Information" as that term is defined in the Motion of Virginia Electric and Power Company for Entry of a Protective Order and Additional Protective Treatment:
- (a) Access to Market Information shall be given to (i) in-house counsel and/or parties not engaged in the business of, or providing services related to, the development, manufacturing, construction, operation, or installation of energy projects (including but not limited to solar, wind, or energy storage developers), energy project equipment supply, wholesale power market participation, independent power production, project bidding, or electric generating business development; (ii) outside retained counsel; or (iii) individual consultants who have been retained by a party for the purposes of providing consulting services and/or expert testimony in this proceeding
 - (b) Oral testimony concerning the Market Information will be taken in camera.
- (c) If an attorney licensed to practice law in Virginia, admitted *pro hac vice* in this case, or employed as corporate counsel, returning or destroying documents containing Market Information except for the attorney's notes and work product, and documents that are part of the record in this proceeding (including, but not limited to, transcripts, testimony, exhibits, pleadings, rulings, and orders); and if not covered or included in the above categories, returning or destroying all documents containing Market Information upon conclusion of the proceedings, and any appeal thereof;
- (d) No party or consultant may use the Market Information to give any party or any competitor of any participant a commercial advantage; provided, however, that nothing in the agreement shall prevent any person signing it from using the Market Information in this proceeding consistent with the terms of the agreement and the Protective Ruling and Additional Protective Treatment for Extraordinarily Sensitive Market Information; and
- (e) Subject to the provisions of the Protective Ruling and Additional Protective Treatment for Extraordinarily Sensitive Market Information, and execution by appropriate party representatives (other than Staff) of the "Agreement to Adhere to Protective Ruling and Additional Protective Treatment for Extraordinarily Sensitive Market Information" included as Attachment B, the Company agrees to provide copies of the Market Information.

Mary Renae Carter
M. Renae Carter

Senior Hearing Examiner

Document Control Center is requested to send a copy of the above Protective Ruling and Additional Protective Treatment for Extraordinarily Sensitive Market Information to all persons on the official Service List in this matter. The Service List is available from the Clerk of the State Corporation Commission, c/o Document Control Center, 1300 East Main Street, First Floor, Richmond, Virginia 23219.

ATTACHMENT A

APPLICATION OF

VIRGINIA ELECTRIC AND POWER COMPANY

CASE NO. PUR-2024-00123

For an update of the 100 percent renewable energy tariff, designated Rider TRG, pursuant to §§ 56-577 A 5 and 56-234 of the Code of Virginia

AGREEMENT TO ADHERE TO PROTECTIVE RULING PROVIDING FOR CONFIDENTIAL TREATMENT

I, , on beh	nalf of and representing ,	
hereby acknowledge having read and understo		
	narily Sensitive Market Information ("Ruling")	
	024, and agree to treat all Confidential Information	
	R-2024-00123 as set forth in that Ruling. Such	
treatment shall include, but not be limited to:	(1) not disseminating, communicating, or	
revealing any Confidential Information to any	• •	
authorized to receive Confidential Information	n under that Ruling; (2) if an attorney licensed to	
practice law in Virginia, admitted pro hac vice	e in this case, or employed as corporate counsel,	
returning or destroying all Confidential Inforn	nation produced pursuant to that ruling except for	
the attorney's notes and work product, and do	cuments that are part of the record in this	
proceeding (including, but not limited to, transcripts, testimony, exhibits, pleadings, rulings, and		
order); and (3) if not covered by (2), above, re	eturning or destroying all Confidential Information	
produced pursuant to that Ruling.		
	Signature	
	Printed Name	
	r timed wame	
	On behalf of	
	Date	

ATTACHMENT B

APPLICATION OF

VIRGINIA ELECTRIC AND POWER COMPANY

CASE NO. PUR-2024-00123

For an update of the 100 percent renewable energy tariff, designated Rider TRG, pursuant to §§ 56-577 A 5 and 56-234 of the Code of Virginia

AGREEMENT TO ADHERE TO PROTECTIVE RULING AND ADDITIONAL PROTECTIVE TREATMENT FOR EXTRAORDINARILY SENSITIVE MARKET INFORMATION

Treatment for Extraord September 16, 2024, a connection with Case Agreement attest that a providing services related energy projects (include equipment supply, who or electric generating a consultants who have expert testimony in this disseminating, commus specifically authorized Market Information was admitted pro hac vice documents containing except for the attorney proceeding (including, (4) if not covered by (5) Ruling; and (5) no par competitor of any part shall prevent any personnection with the content of the proceeding (15) or part shall prevent any personnection with Case Agreement attention with the content of the cont	, on behalf of an ead and understood the terms of the dinarily Sensitive Market Information agree to treat all extraordinarity. No. PUR-2024-00123 as set forth they are (a) in-house counsel and atted to, the development, manufacting but not limited to solar, wind olesale power market participation business development; (b) outside been retained by a party for the pais proceeding. The treatment shaunicating, or revealing any Market to receive such information under ill be taken in camera; (3) if an aring this case, or employed as corporated in this case, or employed as corporated in this case, or employed as corporated in the camera and work product, and do to the consultant may use the Market Information upon conclustry or consultant may use the Market Information and the commercial advantage; on signing this Agreement from upons of this Agreement and that Ruman in the commercial advantage; on signing this Agreement and that Ruman in the commercial advantage;	ation ("Ruling") entered a ly sensitive Market Information in that Ruling. The person in	in this proceeding on mation that I receive in sons signing this in the business of, or eration, or installation of lopers), energy project oduction, project bidding, individual outside isulting services and/or ited to: (1) not son, other than Staff, not stimony concerning the ce law in Virginia, or destroying all and any appeal thereof, it the record in this ings, rulings, and order); produced pursuant to that my party or any nothing in this Agreement
Signature		Printed Name	
On behalf of		Date	