

## Langdon, Robin

---

**Subject:** FW: VSL Assumption (RIA for the Proposed Reconsideration of the PM2.5 NAAQS)

---

**From:** Ramkrishnan, Bharat <[Bharat.Ramkrishnan@nera.com](mailto:Bharat.Ramkrishnan@nera.com)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, February 1, 2023 10:58 AM

**To:** Fann, Neal <[Fann.Neal@epa.gov](mailto:Fann.Neal@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: VSL Assumption (RIA for the Proposed Reconsideration of the PM2.5 NAAQS)

Dear Neal,  
Thanks for sending this across.

Thanks,  
Bharat

---

**From:** Fann, Neal <[Fann.Neal@epa.gov](mailto:Fann.Neal@epa.gov)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, January 31, 2023 5:31 PM


**To:** Ramkrishnan, Bharat <[Bharat.Ramkrishnan@nera.com](mailto:Bharat.Ramkrishnan@nera.com)>

**Cc:** Etchells, Elizabeth <[Etchells.Elizabeth@epa.gov](mailto:Etchells.Elizabeth@epa.gov)>; Langdon, Robin <[Langdon.Robin@epa.gov](mailto:Langdon.Robin@epa.gov)>; Kelly, James <[kelly.james@epa.gov](mailto:kelly.james@epa.gov)>; Perlmutter, Lars <[perlmutter.lars@epa.gov](mailto:perlmutter.lars@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: VSL Assumption (RIA for the Proposed Reconsideration of the PM2.5 NAAQS)

**CAUTION:** This email originated outside the company. Do not click links or open attachments unless you are expecting them from the sender.

Dear Bharat,

Thanks for your question regarding the VSL used to quantify the monetized benefits of the PM NAAQS. Linked  [here](#) you'll find a zip archive containing the files we used to perform the benefits analysis using the BenMAP tool. I believe this will provide you with the information you requested. Please let me know if you run into any problems downloading the files.

Best wishes,  
Neal Fann

---

**From:** Ramkrishnan, Bharat <[Bharat.Ramkrishnan@nera.com](mailto:Bharat.Ramkrishnan@nera.com)>

**Sent:** Monday, January 30, 2023 9:39 AM

**To:** Kelly, James <[kelly.james@epa.gov](mailto:kelly.james@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Etchells, Elizabeth <[Etchells.Elizabeth@epa.gov](mailto:Etchells.Elizabeth@epa.gov)>; Perlmutter, Lars <[perlmutter.lars@epa.gov](mailto:perlmutter.lars@epa.gov)>; Langdon, Robin <[Langdon.Robin@epa.gov](mailto:Langdon.Robin@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** VSL Assumption (RIA for the Proposed Reconsideration of the PM2.5 NAAQS)

Dear Dr. Kelly,  
Thanks again for directing me to the air quality grids employed in the calculation of the benefits estimates in the RIA for the Proposed Reconsideration of the PM2.5 NAAQS.  
I did have one question relating to the benefits calculations in the RIA which I'm hoping you can help answer (or direct me to someone else on your team who can help).  
I noted that the benefits in the RIA are reported in millions of 2017\$.

I noted that the attached TSD provided the VSL used in the calculation of the monetized benefits in 2015\$ (first row of Table 21).

I attempted to look in the RIA but did not see the corresponding VSL value in 2017\$ (with 3% and 7% discount rates). Is this reported somewhere or can this be backed out somehow using the information in the RIA?

Thanks again for your help.

Thanks,  
Bharat

---

**Bharat Ramkrishnan**  
Consultant  
**NERA Washington, DC**  
Tel: 1-202-466-9246  
Mobile: 1-412-482-4217

---

---

This e-mail and any attachments may be confidential or legally privileged. If you received this message in error or are not the intended recipient, you should destroy the e-mail message and any attachments or copies, and you are prohibited from retaining, distributing, disclosing or using any information contained herein. Please inform us of the erroneous delivery by return e-mail. Thank you for your cooperation. For more information on how we use your personal data please see our [Privacy Notice](#).

---

This e-mail and any attachments may be confidential or legally privileged. If you received this message in error or are not the intended recipient, you should destroy the e-mail message and any attachments or copies, and you are prohibited from retaining, distributing, disclosing or using any information contained herein. Please inform us of the erroneous delivery by return e-mail. Thank you for your cooperation. For more information on how we use your personal data please see our [Privacy Notice](#).